

BEFORE THE STATE OF WISCONSIN Division Of Hearings And Appeals

Case No.: 97-H-1029

In the Matter of a 1970 Chevrolet, VIN 194370S409085.

FINAL DECISION

Dennis Siegrist applied to the Department of Transportation for a title and registration to the 1970 Chevrolet Corvette which is the subject of this hearing. By letter dated March 17, 1997, the Department refused to issue a title or registration to Mr. Siegrist for the subject vehicle. By letter dated March 19, 1997, Dennis Siegrist requested a hearing to review the Department's decision.

Pursuant to due notice a hearing was held on May 8, 1997, in Waukesha, Wisconsin, before Mark J. Kaiser, Administrative Law Judge.

In Accordance with secs. 227.47 and 227.53(1)(c), Stats., the parties to this proceeding are certified as follows:

Dennis Siegrist, petitioner, by

Attorney Willis Zick 151 Bank Street Waukesha, WI 53186

Earl Hein, by

Attorney David H. Hickey 2212 East Moreland Boulevard, #102 Waukesha, WI 53186

Wisconsin Department of Transportation,

No appearance

The Administrative Law Judge issued a proposed decision on May 19, 1997. No comments on the proposed decision were received. The proposed decision is adopted as the final decision in this matter.

Findings of Fact

The Administrator finds:

- On May 25, 1996, Dennis E. and Jerri L. Siegrist contracted to purchase a 1970 Chevrolet, VIN 194370S409085, from Capitol Corvette. Pursuant to the purchase contract, the Siegrists traded in a 1973 Chevrolet Corvette plus paid \$10,500.00 including tax, license and title fees for the Corvette. The Siegrists took possession of the Corvette and retained possession of the vehicle as of the date of the hearing in this matter.
- 2. In May, 1996, Capitol Corvette was a motor vehicle dealer conducting business at 5400 King James Way, Madison, Wisconsin, 53719. Capitol Corvette was in the business of selling used Corvettes. Capitol Corvette was a sole proprietorship and held motor vehicle dealer license number 1047. David C. Larson was the owner and sole proprietor of Capitol Corvette. On December 9, 1996, the Division of Hearings and Appeals issued an order revoking Capitol Corvette's motor vehicle dealer license (Docket Nos. 96-H-986 and 96-H-993).
- 3. The Division of Motor Vehicles of the Department of Transportation (DMV) is part of an agency of the State of Wisconsin and is authorized under sec. 218.01, Stats., to license, inspect, and regulate motor vehicle dealers in Wisconsin. DMV also has the authority under chapters 341 and 342, Stats., to issue titles and registration for motor vehicles in Wisconsin.
- 4. The 1970 Chevrolet Corvette purchased by the Siegrists was owned by Earl W. and Bonnie L. Hein. The Heins had entered into a storage and consignment agreement with Capitol Corvette to sell the vehicle. Capitol Corvette failed to pay the Heins the purchase price for this vehicle, in violation of the terms of the agreement.
- 5. The Siegrists applied to the DMV for a Wisconsin title and registration for the subject vehicle. Because of conflicting ownership claims, the DMV refused to issue a title or registration to the Siegrists for the subject vehicle.
- 6. When the Siegrists purchased the subject vehicle from Capitol Corvette, they were not aware that it was owned by Earl and Bonnie Hein or that the Corvette was sold on consignment by Capitol Corvette for the Heins. The Siegrists purchased the Corvette at Capitol Corvette's business premises and they believed that Capitol Corvette owned this vehicle and had the authority to sell it. Capitol Corvette did not inform the Siegrists that the Corvette was owned by the Heins.
- 7. Dennis Siegrist has never worked for an automobile dealer or in the automotive industry. Dennis Siegrist purchased the 1973 Chevrolet Corvette which was traded in for the subject vehicle from Capitol Corvette. Other than these two transactions, neither Dennis nor Jerri Siegrist has had any financial dealings with Capitol Corvette or David Larson.

8. Dennis and Bonnie Siegrist purchased the subject motor vehicle in good faith and without knowledge that the sale was in violation of the ownership rights of Earl and Bonnie Hein. The Siegrists are buyers in the ordinary course of business of the subject motor vehicle

Discussion

Dennis and Bonnie Siegrist have applied to the DMV for a certificate of title and registration for the subject motor vehicle. Pursuant to secs. 342.11(1) AND 342.12(2), Stats., the DMV refused to issue a title or registration to the Siegrists for the subject motor vehicle.¹

The Wisconsin motor vehicle code is silent with respect to issuance of a title and registration in this situation. The transaction is regulated by the Uniform Commercial Code. Pursuant to the sec. 402.403(2), Stats., "[a]ny entrusting of possession of goods to a merchant who deals in goods of that kind gives the merchant power to transfer all rights of the entruster to a buyer in ordinary course of business." In the instant matter, Earl and Bonnie Hein entrusted the subject motor vehicle to Capitol Corvette for the purpose of selling the vehicle. Accordingly, Capitol Corvette had the power to transfer ownership of the vehicle to a buyer.

Capitol Corvette has authority to transfer interest in the vehicle even if the consignor has retained title. In general, the interest of a consignor is not protected unless the consignor complies with one of the three alternatives set forth at sec. 402.326(3), Stats., relating to

The department shall refuse issuance of a certificate of title for any of the following reasons:

- (1) The department has reasonable grounds to believe that.
 - (a) The person alleged to be the owner of the vehicle is not the owner
 - (b) The application contains a false or fraudulent statement.

Sec. 342.12(2), Stats., provides in relevant part

- (2) If the department is not satisfied as to the ownership of the vehicle or that there are no undisclosed security interests in it, the department, subject to sub. (3), shall either:
 - (a) Withhold issuance of a certificate of title until the applicant presents documents reasonable sufficient to satisfy the department as to the applicant's ownership of the vehicle and that there are no undisclosed security interests in it, or
 - (b) Issue a distinctive certificate of title pursuant to sec 342 10(4) or 342.283

¹ Sec. 342.11(1). Stats, provides in relevant part

Case No. 97-H-1029 May 19, 1997 Page 4

informing prospective creditors of the consignee of a potential security interest.² The Heins did not allege that they complied with the provisions of sec. 402.326(3), Stats.

The Siegrists purchased the vehicle from Capitol Corvette. They were unaware that Capitol Corvette was selling the vehicle on consignment. Even if the Siegrists had been aware that the vehicle was being sold on consignment, there is no evidence that they should have suspected that Capitol Corvette did not intend to use the proceeds of this sale to pay the consignor or the sale was fraudulent in any manner.

Dennis and Jerri Siegrist have the burden to prove that they are buyers in the ordinary course of business. The phrase "buyer in the ordinary course of business" is defined at sec. 402.201(9), Stats. Sec. 401.201(9), Stats., provides in relevant part that: "Buyer in ordinary course of business" means a person who in good faith and without knowledge that the sale to the person is in violation of the ownership rights or security interest of a 3rd party in the goods buys in ordinary course from a person in the business of selling goods of that kind' Based on the evidence in the record, the Siegrists were good faith purchasers who purchased the subject vehicle without knowledge that the sale was in violation of the ownership rights of Earl and Bonnie Hein. The Siegrists purchased the vehicle from Capitol Corvette, a licensed motor vehicle dealer, which at the time of the purchase was a company in the business of selling used motor vehicle.

Conclusions of Law

The Administrator concludes:

1. Pursuant to sec. 402.403(2), Stats., Capitol Corvette had the power to transfer all of Earl and Bonnie Hein's ownership rights in the subject motor vehicle to a buyer in the ordinary course of business.

- (a) Complies with an applicable law providing for a consignor's interest or the like to be evidenced by a sign; or
- (b) Establishes that the person conducting the business is generally known by that person's creditors to be substantially engaged in selling the goods of others; or
- (c) Complies with the filing provisions of ch 409.

² Sec 402 326(3), Stats., provides in relevant part:

⁽³⁾ Where goods are delivered to a person for sale and such person maintains a place of business at which the person deals in goods of the kind involved, under a name other than the name of the person making delivery, then with respect to claims of creditors of the person conducting the business the goods are deemed to be on sale or return. This subsection is applicable even though an agreement purports to reserve title to the person making delivery until payment or resale or uses such words as "on consignment" or "on memorandum." However, this subsection is not applicable if the person making delivery.

- 2. Dennis and Jerri Siegrist are buyers in the ordinary course of business of the subject motor vehicle. Pursuant to sec. 402.403, Stats., the Siegrists have acquired title and ownership of the subject motor vehicle.
- 3. Pursuant to secs. 346.26 and 227.43(1)(bg), Stats., the Division of Hearings and Appeals has the authority to issue the following order.

Order

The Administrator orders:

The Division of Motor Vehicles of the Department of Transportation shall issue a motor vehicle title and registration to Dennis and Jerri Siegrist for the 1970 Chevrolet Corvette, VIN 194370S409085, which is the subject of this matter.

Dated at Madison, Wisconsin on June 6, 1997.

FAX:

STATE OF WISCONSIN DIVISION OF HEARINGS AND APPEALS 5005 University Avenue, Suite 201

Madison, Wisconsin 53705 Telephone: (608) 266-7709

(608) 267-2,744

Administrator

F-\DOCS\DECISION\SIEGRIST.FIN